BB creams, concealers, mascaras **Cosmetics: too many substances of concern** Be cautious, especially if



pregnant Executive summary

© iStock photo

After children's sunscreens and baby cosmetics, Wecf France releases a survey on cosmetic products. We made the choice of 3 categories of make-up products, which many women use everyday, and whose use has not decreased during the Covid-19 pandemic: BB creams, concealers and mascaras. Despite an extensive regulation at EU level, are these products always free from ingredients of potential concern for human health, especially pregnant women, known to be particularly vulnerable?

In May 2021, we purchased 17 BB creams, 15 concealers and 15 mascaras, sold in supermarkets, perfume stores, drugstores and organic shops. We investigated the ingredients of the 47 products and surveyed the labels looking for substances of concern for human health and/or ecosystems.

Based on existing scientific literature, we identified 37 substances of concern, including endocrine disruptors, persistent and bioaccumulative substances, nanoparticles or allergens. We also identified 50 plastic ingredients in a huge number of the 47 products.

We classified the 37 substances of concern in 3 categories: of very high concern, of high concern and of moderate concern:



13 substances of very high concern: scientific consensus for classification or known major hazards for human/animal health (CMR, endocrine disruptors, PBT, neurotoxic or with equivalent levels of concern).

9 substances of high concern: contact allergens, CMR, PBT or suspected EDCs but for which doubts still exist on classification, and which trigger a precautionary approach.

15 substances of moderate concern: trigger harmful consequences for ecosystems or potential risks for allergy, but where existing data require more investigation.



Our results: the 47 products of our survey

Brands in alphabetical order

- Substances of very high concern
- Substances of high concern
- Substances of moderate concern

BB creams

		Purchased at*	Number of ingredients of concern	Benzyl salicylate	BHT	Butylphényl methylpropional	Cyclomethicone	Cyclohexasiloxane	Cyclopentasiloxane	Dioxyde de titane [nano]	Ethylhexyl Methoxycinnamate	Ethylparaben	Methylparaben	Octocrylene	Zinc oxide [nano]	Phenoxyethanol	Benzyl alcohol	Bis-EthylhexyloxyphenolMethoxyphenylTriazine	Cl 77266 Black 2 [nano]	Buty/Methoxydibenzoy/methane (Avobenzone)	Diethylhexyl Butamido Triazone	Dioxyde de titane ou CI 77891**	Methylene Bis-Benzotriazolyl Tetramethylbutylphenol (MBBT)	Silica [nano]	Talc	Benzyl benzoate	Chlorphenesin	Citral	Citronellol	Diethylamino hydroxybenzoyl hexyl benzoate	Drometrizole Trisiloxane	Ethylhexyl salicylate	Ethylhexyl triazone	Eugenol	Geraniol	Hexyl cinnamal	Limonene	Linalool	Parfum/fragrance	Terephthalylidene Dicamphor Sulfonic Acid	plastic ingredients
Active Hydroxy History History History History History History	AVENE Hydrance BB-Légère Light SPF 30	PH	6															•		•	•	•	•																•		0
REARIES	BOURJOIS Healthy Mix BB Cream anti-fatigue - teinte foncée	GS	7		•				•		•					•						•					•												•		0
	THE BODY SHOP Crème teintée éclat peau nue SPF30 fair 01	Ρ	10		•					•	•			•		•				•		•			•		•												•		
	CAUDALIE Teint divin Crème teintée minérale peaux mates	PH	6	•		•			•													•																•	•	¢	0
CLAUNS O2 Bostin Described Marchane Mar	CLARINS BB skin Detox Fluide SPF 25 - teinte medium	Ρ	11			•				•						•						•				•			•					•		•	•	•	•		0
	COULEUR CARAMEL BB crème 6 actions teinte 12	MB	3														•					•																	•		
	ERBORIAN BB crème Korean Formula Effet transparent 5-en-1 teinte nude	PH	7				•			•	•				•	•						•			•																0
CONCEPTION OF CO	GARNIER BB crème soin perfecteur tout en 1 FPS 15 teinte medium	GS	12	•	•			•			•					•	•					•						•							•		•	•	•		0
	JONZAC BB crème peau parfaite SPF 10 teinte claire	MB	2																			•																	•		

Brands in alphabetical order

- Substances of very high concern
- Substances of high concern
- Substances of moderate concern

		Purchased at*	Number of ingredients of concern	Benzyl salicylate	BHT	Butylphényl methylpropional	Cyclomethicone Cyclohexasiloxane	Cvclopentasiloxane	Dioxyde de titane [nano]	Ethylhexyl Methoxycinnamate	Ethylparaben	Methylparaben	Octocrylene	Zinc oxide [nano]	Phenoxyethanol	Benzyl alcohol	Bis-Ethylhexyloxyphenol Methoxyphenyl Triazine	Cl 77266 Black 2 [nano]	Buty/Methoxydibenzoy/methane (Avobenzone)	Diethylhexyl Butamido Triazone	Dioxyde de titane ou CI 77891**	Methylene Bis-Benzotriazolyl Tetramethylbutylphenol (MBBT)	Silica [nano]	Talc	Benzyl benzoate	Chlorphenesin	Citral	Citronellol	Diethylamino hydroxybenzoyl hexyl benzoate	Drometrizole Trisiloxane	Ethylhexyl salicylate	Ethylhexyl triazone	Eugenol	Geraniol	Hexyl cinnamal	Limonene	Linalool	Parfum/fragrance	Terephthalylidene Dicamphor Sulfonic Acid	plastic ingredients
Const Second	KIKO Konscious Vegan BB Mousse - teinte OS	Ρ	3												•						•																	•		0
Merkke.	MELVITA Nectar de roses BB crème SPF15 teinte rose des sables	MB	6																									•						•		•	•	•		
BBB Brances Br	NIVEA BB crème 5 en 1 Hydratation 24H FPS 15 - teinte medium	GS	12										•		•	•	•		•		•		,	•				•						•		•	•	•		0
THE COLOR	L'OREAL BB C'est magic perfecteur de teint 5 en 1 teinte medium foncé	GS	7				•	•				•			•						•															•		•		0
	RIMMEL BB cream beauty balm Medium 9 en 1 SPF15 teinte 002	GS	13		•	•		•		•					•						•					•		•						•	•	•	•	•		0
	LA ROCHE POSAY BB crème Hydreane SPF 20 teinte medium	PH	9		•								•		•				•		•				•					•								•	•	0
	SO'BIO ETIC (Lea Nature) BB crème perfectrice teinte medium	GS	7																		•					•	•	•						•		•	•	•		
	URIAGE Roséliane CC Cream SPF 30 - teinte universelle	PH	10		•					•					•		•				•					•			•		•	•						•		0

* MB = organic shop - GS = supermarket - PH = drugstore - P = perfume store

Concealers

Brands in alphabetical order

- Substances of very high concern
- Substances of high concern
- Substances of moderate concern

		Purchased at*	Number of ingredients of concern	Benzyl salicylate	BHT	Butylphényl methylpropional	Cyclomethicone	Cyclohexasiloxane	Cyclopentasiloxane	Dioxyde de titane [nano]	Ethylhexyl Methoxycinnamate	Ethylparaben	Methylparaben	Octocrylene	Zinc oxide [nano]	Phenoxyethanol	Benzyl alcohol	Bis-Ethylhexyloxyphenol Methoxyphenyl Triazine	Cl 77266 Black 2 [nano]	Buty/Methoxydibenzoy/methane(Avobenzone)	Diethylhexyl Butamido Triazone	Dioxyde de titane ou CI 77891**	Methylene Bis-Benzotriazolyl Tetramethylbutylohenol (MBRT)	Silica [nano]	Talc	Benzyl benzoate	Chlorphenesin	Citral	Citronellol	Diethylamino hydroxybenzoyl hexyl benzoate	Drometrizole Trisiloxane	Ethylhexyl salicylate	Ethylhexyl triazone	Eugenol	Geraniol	Hexyl cinnamal	Limonene	Linalool	Parfum/fragrance	Terephthalylidene Dicamphor Sulfonic Acid	plastic ingredients
	AVENE Couvrance Pinceau correcteur peaux sensibles teinte beige	PH	7		•				•	•	•				•							•					•														0
	THE BODY SHOP Correcteur Eclat Peau Nue - teinte light	Ρ	2													•						•																			0
	EYE CARE Pinceau anticernes Peau et yeux sensibles - teinte beige clair	PH	2																			•			•																0
and the second second	FENTY BEAUTY Pro Filt'r Anticernes retouche instantanée teinte 150	Ρ	2																			•			•																0
COLUMN AND	GUERLAIN Anti-Cernes Correcteur Multi-Perfection teinte 05	Ρ	3						•							•						•																			0
RELEASE MORE MARKED MORE MARKED MORE MARKED 24H/LOBINGS	KIKO Full coverage correcteur de teint teinte 01	Ρ	2																			•																	•		0
	LANCÔME Effacernes longue tenue SPF 30 teinte beige pastel 01	Ρ	5						•	•						•						•			•																0
COVER (1)	LAVERA Natural Cover & care stick teinte ivory 01	MB	8	•													•					•						•	•						•		•	•	•		
	MAYBELLINE (GEMEY) Effaceur correcteur multi-usages teinte beige nu	GS	7					•	•			•	•			•						•					•														0

* MB = organic shop - GS = supermarket - PH = drugstore - P = perfume store

Brands in alphabetical order

- Substances of very high concern
- Substances of high concern
- Substances of moderate concern

		Purchased at*	Number of ingredients of concern	Benzyl salicylate	BHT	Butylphényl methylpropional	Cyclomethicone	Cyclohexasiloxane	Cyclopentasiloxane	Dioxyde de titane [nano]	Ethylhexyl Methoxycinnamate	Ethylparaben	Methylparaben	Octocrylene	Zinc oxide [nano]	Phenoxyethanol	Benzyl alcohol	Bis-Ethylhexyloxyphenol Methoxyphenyl Triazine	Cl 77266 Black 2 [nano]	Butyl Methoxyclibenzoyhmethane (Avobenzone)	Diethylhexyl Butamido Triazone	Dioxyde de titane ou CI 77891**	Methylene Bis-Benzotriazolyl Tetramethylbutylphenol (MBBT)	Silica [nano]	Talc	Benzyl benzoate	Chlorphenesin	Citral	Citronellol	Diethylamino hydroxybenzoyl hexyl benzoate	Drometrizole Trisiloxane	Ethylhexyl salicylate	Ethylhexyl triazone	Eugenol	Geraniol	Hexyl cinnamal	Limonene	Linalool	Parfum/fragrance	Terephthalylidene Dicamphor Sulfonic Acid	plastic ingredients
	L'OREAL Accord Parfait anti-cernes soin yeux - teinte ambre	GS	2													•						•																			0
Brinn acar mark billing	Dr PIERRE RICAUD Touche 0 défaut anticernes correcteur teinte moyen	Ρ	4													•	•					•					•														0
1 minute	LA ROCHE-POSAY Toleriane Pinceau correcteur sans parfum allergy tested- teinte peaux mates	PH	3						•													•		•																	0
1 A A A A A A A A A A A A A A A A A A A	SEPHORA Best skin ever anticernes teinte 26	Ρ	2														•					•																			0
	VICHY Dermablend SOS Cover Stick SPF 25 teinte opal	РН	2																			•			•																
an an er er es.	YVES ROCHER Anti-cernes Haute couvrance lumière teinte beige 150	Ρ	5													•	•					•			•		•														0

* MB = organic shop - GS = supermarket - PH = drugstore - P = perfume store

Mascaras

Brands in alphabetical order

- Substances of very high concern
- Substances of high concern
- Substances of moderate concern

		Purchased at*	Number of ingredients of concern	Benzyl salicylate	BHT	Butylphényl methylpropional	Cyclomethicone	Cyclohexasiloxane	Cyclopentasiloxane	Dioxyde de titane [nano]	Ethylnexyl Methoxycinnamate			Uctocrylene	Zinc oxide [nano]	Phenoxyethanol	Benzyl alcohol	Bis-Ethylhexyloxyphenol Methoxyphenyl Triazine	Cl 77266 Black 2 [nano]	Buty/Methoxydibenzoy/Imethane (Avobenzone)	Diethylhexyl Butamido Triazone	Dioxyde de titane ou CI 77891**	Methylene Bis-Benzotriazolyl Tetramethylhythologia (AMBT)	Silica [nano]	Talc	Benzyl benzoate	Chlorphenesin	Citral	Citronellol	Diethylamino hydroxybenzoyl hexyl benzoate	Drometrizole Trisiloxane	Ethylhexyl salicylate	Ethylhexyl triazone	Eugenol	Geraniol	Hexyl cinnamal	Limonene	Linalool	Parfum/fragrance	Terephthalylidene Dicamphor Sulfonic Acid	plastic ingredients
A Construct A Con	AVENE Couvrance Mascara haute tolérance teinte brun	PH	0																																						
	BOURJOIS Mascara effet Push Up Volume Glamour wonder black	GS	3		•				•													•																			0
	CHANEL Le Volume Révolution de Chanel teinte Noir 10	Ρ	4									•	•			•			•			•																			0
TINKE A STATE OF	CLINIQUE Mascara High Impact Effet cils liftés teinte Noir	PH	3		•											•						•																			0
	COULEUR CARAMEL Mascara Perfect Volume Extrême - teinte Noir	MB	3														•					•																	•		
20 Martine Martine Discourse	DIOR Diorshow Waterproof Mascara volume sur-mesure teinte Bleu Azur	Ρ	3		•										,	•						•																			0
	EYE CARE Mascara haute tolérance yeux sensibles teinte Noir	PH	0																																						0
Reference Marting Barrier KUNCO Alartar	KIKO Darker blackest volume & colour intensifier mascara	Ρ	4		•											•	•					•																			0
VUIII Casas 🕑 🛐	LAVERA Volume Mascara teinte Noir 01	MB	4																									•									•	•	•		

* MB = organic shop - GS = supermarket - PH = drugstore - P = perfume store

Brands in alphabetical order

- Substances of very high concern
- Substances of high concern
- Substances of moderate concern

		Purchased at*	Number of ingredients of concern	Benzyl salicylate	BHT	Butylphényl methylpropional	Cyclomethicone	Cyclohexasiloxane	Dioxyde de titane [nano]	Ethylnexyl Methoxychnamate	Ethylparaben	Methylparaben	Uctocrylene	Zinc oxide [nano]	Phenoxyethanol	Benzyl alcohol	Bis-Ethylhexyloxyphenol Methoxyphenyl Triazine	Cl 77266 Black 2 [nano]	Buty/Methoxydibenzoy/methane(Avobenzone)	Diethylhexyl Butamido Triazone	Dioxyde de titane ou CI 77891**	Methylene Bis-Benzotriazolyl Tetramethylbutylphenol (MBBT)	Silica [nano]	Talc	Benzyl benzoate	Chlorphenesin	Citral	Citronellol	Diethylamino hydroxybenzoyl hexyl benzoate	Drometrizole Trisiloxane	Ethylhexyl salicylate	Ethylhexyl triazone	Eugenol	Geraniol	Hexyl cinnamal	Limonene	Linalool	Parfum/fragrance	Terephthalylidene Dicamphor Sulfonic Acid	plastic ingredients
	MAYBELLINE (GEMEY) Colossal Big shot teinte Extra Noir	GS	3		•									•	•						•																			0
	RIMMEL Scandal Eyes on demand Volume - teinte Noir	GS	2											,	•						•																			0
And a second sec	LA ROCHE-POSAY Toleriane Mascara extension teinte Noir	PH	1																		•																			0
	SEPHORA Size Up Mascara teinte Ultra Noir	Ρ	1											,	•																									0
	YVES ROCHER Mascara Intense Métamorphose teinte Noir	Ρ	1													•																								0
	ZAO Mascara Aloe vera teinte Noir	MB	0																																					

* MB = organic shop - GS = supermarket - PH = drugstore - P = perfume store

Our main results

- 31 products out of 47, more than 80% contain at least one ingredient of very high concern.
- On the 37 substances of concern we identified, 7 are endocrine disruptors of very high concern.
- 36 products contain plastic ingredients.
- BB creams are the most problematic category, with one of them containing 13 substances of concern.
- The organic cosmetics of our survey rank above non-organic ones.

Our main demands

- Ban ingredients which we identified as of very high concern.
- Establish a pictogram, similar to the one displayed on alcohol, to warn pregnant women of the presence in cosmetics of ingredients suspected of being of concern for human health, in particular endocrine disruptors.
- Ensure the correct labelling of nanoparticle ingredients.
- Substitute plastic ingredients.

Our tips

- Avoid substances which we identified as *of very high concern*, especially if you are pregnant or plan to become pregnant.
- Prefer organic products and/or with labelling or logos which bring a guarantee on the absence of certain ingredients of concern.
- Avoid cosmetics which contain endocrine disruptors, nanoparticles, allergens, plastics, etc.
- Be cautious with perfumed cosmetics, which may contain allergens non indicated on the packaging. In case of allergies, carefully read the label to find potential fragrance allergens and better choose cosmetics for sensitive skin and/ or perfume-free.
- Do not buy a product if you cannot read the ingredients list: ingredients of certain cosmetics of our survey, such as concealers or mascaras are sometimes not readable, which prevents consumers from making an informed choice.
- Do ask questions to retailers at the time of purchase; This can contribute to a faster substitution of certain ingredients of concern.
- Avoid using too many cosmetics together and everyday, to limit the so-called "cocktail effect".
- Remove your make-up at the end of the day, to allow the skin to breathe.
- More information in our pocket guides available on www.wecf-france.org



Cosmétiques bébé